



ILRC SF
support • information • advocacy

November 19, 2013
To Whom it May Concern:

As a person with a disability, a lifelong advocate of the rights of people with disabilities, and the Executive Director of the Independent Living Resource Center San Francisco, a disability rights organization, I fully support the proposed changes to San Francisco's Accessible Parking Policy, which include:

1. Increasing blue zones by 70%
2. Improving enforcement of placard misuse
3. Improving DMV oversight of placard approvals
4. Allowing jurisdictions to require placard holders to pay at the meter for on-street parking
5. Directing revenue to accessibility improvements, and
6. Allowing jurisdictions to establish reasonable time limits for placard holders

A great deal of time and thought went into developing these proposed changes, and members of the disability community – including myself - were directly involved throughout the process. The recommendations favor equity for people with disabilities while addressing what it has come to identify as rampant abuse by drivers for whom disability placards and Blue Zones were never intended.

The current system for Accessible Parking was launched 30 years ago - before the ADA was signed into law - at a time when San Francisco, and society as a whole, was far less accessible than it is today. This antiquated system makes it astoundingly simple for any person with an impairment - a broken leg, for instance - to receive a disability placard and keep it for life. The system was never intended to provide non-disabled drivers who suffer minor impairments with a lifetime of unlimited free parking. Unfortunately, it is currently being used as such by many, forcing people with significant functional limitations to struggle to find parking. Applications for placards have gone up by 200%, which is suspiciously disproportionate to the number of drivers in San Francisco who have disabilities. This is a program that Joe Public has figured out how to hack.

In stark contrast, the proposed changes address the progress that has since been made by disability rights advocates, and by our culture, as a whole. We have reached a point in time where achieving equity no longer means free parking for anyone with a disability placard (which, sadly, are too easily obtained by fraudsters who do not have disabilities.)

The conditional recommendation to remove the meter payment exemption has been made in an effort to dissuade would-be abusers from using ill-gotten placards to park in metered spots without paying. The result of a similar shift in another major American city - Philadelphia - speaks volumes: availability of metered parking spaces increased by 500%. To be clear, proposed meter payments will only be required if payment options are made fully accessible - the absence of which acted as a trigger for payment exemption during the program's inception.

The recommendation that addresses reasonable time limits reflects the growth of equity in San Francisco over the last 30 years. We are a very different city than when this system was first adopted. Steps were taken back then to help level the playing field and, as the City becomes more accessible and we get closer to true equity, amending the parameters in areas such as parking time limits makes sense: members of the Accessible Parking Policy Advisory Committee who themselves drive (or are driven) and park in San Francisco agree that the time has come to establish reasonable time limits on parking.

As it stands, today, the system leaves a lot to be desired. Every individual who engages in dishonest placard use deprives a person with a disability of a parking spot that is rightfully theirs. In addition, s/he deprives the City of revenue which could and should be used to make San Francisco an even more accessible city than it already is.

Sincerely,

Jessie Lorenz
Executive Director

Independent Living Resource Center San Francisco

649 Mission Street, 3rd Floor • San Francisco, CA 94105-4128 • (415) 543-6222 • (415) 543-6318 Fax • (415) 543-6698 TTY only

www.ilrcsf.org



METROPOLITAN
TRANSPORTATION
COMMISSION

Joseph P. Bort MetroCenter
101 Eighth Street
Oakland, CA 94607-4700
TEL 510.817.5700
TTY/TDD 510.817.5769
FAX 510.817.5848
EMAIL info@mtc.ca.gov
WEB www.mtc.ca.gov

November 18, 2013

Asny Rein Worth, Chair
Cities of Contra Costa County

Dave Cortese, Vice Chair
Santa Clara County

Alicia C. Aguirre
Cities of San Mateo County

Tom Azunbrado
U.S. Department of Housing
and Urban Development

Tom Bates
Cities of Alameda County

David Campos
City and County of San Francisco

Bill Dodd
Napa County and Cities

Dorene M. Giacopini
U.S. Department of Transportation

Federal D. Glover
Contra Costa County

Scott Haggerty
Alameda County

Anne W. Halsted
San Francisco Bay Conservation
and Development Commission

Steve Kinsey
Marin County and Cities

Sam Liccardo
San Jose Mayor's Appointee

Mark Luce
Association of Bay Area Governments

Jake Mackenzie
Sonoma County and Cities

Joe Pivzynski
Cities of Santa Clara County

Jean Quan
Oakland Mayor's Appointee

Bijan Sartipi
State Business, Transportation
and Housing Agency

James P. Spering
Solano County and Cities

Adrienne J. Tissier
San Mateo County

Scott Wiener
San Francisco Mayor's Appointee

Steve Heminger
Executive Director

Ami Flemer
Deputy Executive Director, Policy

Andrew B. Fremier
Deputy Executive Director, Operations

San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency Board of Directors
1 South Van Ness Avenue, Seventh Floor
San Francisco, CA 94103

Dear Chairman Nolan and Board Members,

At the invitation of the Mayor's Office on Disability and the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency, I served as a member of the Accessible Parking Policy Advisory Committee whose recommendations are now before you for consideration. The Advisory Committee included a diverse group of stakeholders who participated in an extensive and thoughtful deliberation to develop a list of recommendations to increase access to persons with disabilities and reduce disabled parking placard misuse in San Francisco.

I appreciate the diversity of personal experience and policy perspectives that were discussed by the Advisory Committee and I commend the willingness of the Advisory Committee members to engage in an open dialog, to accept new ideas identified through extensive research on this subject, and to allow meetings to be facilitated in a manner that resulted in meaningful recommendations.

I believe the Advisory Committee's recommendations will effectively address the issues surrounding access to parking that are apparent to all stakeholders, including persons with disabilities for whom access is most necessary, and for all people who work in and support San Francisco's business community, including the employers and employees that they represent. The recommendations are comprehensive and build upon the best practices identified from cities across the country.

As a member of the Advisory Committee, I look forward to your support for, and implementation of, the Committee's recommendations.

Sincerely,

Ann Flemer
Deputy Executive Director, Policy

cc: Ed Reiskin, Director of Transportation
Roberta Boomer, Secretary to the Board
Lisa Foster, Project Manager



SPUR

San Francisco | San Jose

November 18, 2013

San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency
Board of Directors
1 South Van Ness Avenue
Seventh Floor
San Francisco, CA 94103

Chair Nolan and Board Members,

SPUR is writing to demonstrate **our support for the Accessible Parking Policy Advisory Committee recommendations.** These recommendations seek to increase access to parking for people with disabilities while also reducing disabled parking placard misuse.

We appreciate the Mayor's Office on Disability and the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency for their leadership in convening this committee and for working with a broad array of stakeholders to develop an effective list of recommendations.

SPUR is a 100 year-old civic organization and urban policy think tank focused on good planning and good government. We have been a leader in encouraging San Francisco to adopt innovative solutions to urban policy issues. SPUR was instrumental in the creation of the SFMTA as a department in 1999 and remains an active participant in policy issues around public transit and transportation in San Francisco and the region. SPUR met with members of Accessible Parking Policy Advisory Committee as well as SFMTA staff and was supportive of the balanced and thorough approach they took in developing recommendations to study and improve accessible parking in San Francisco.

We believe the committee's recommendations will increase the quality of life not only for those to whom access is most necessary, but also for all people in San Francisco. The recommendations are comprehensive and represent the best practices identified from cities across the country.

The committee process made it clear that the issues surrounding disabled parking placards are apparent to all stakeholders. Not only are people with disabilities unable to find parking where they need it due to the increasing use and misuse of placards, but employees, customers and delivery drivers also face challenges in finding parking. Improving the overall management of the parking supply in San Francisco is a key goal of SPUR's and has economic and environmental benefits.

- CHAIR**
Anne Halsted
- EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR**
Gabriel Metcalf
- URBAN CENTER DIRECTOR**
Diane Filippi
- EXECUTIVE VICE CHAIR**
David Friedman
- VICE CHAIRS**
Alexa Arena
Andy Barnes
Emilio Cruz
Bill Rosetti
Carl Shannon
Lydia Tan
V. Fei Tsen
- SECRETARY**
Mary McCue
- TREASURER**
Bob Gamble
- IMMEDIATE PAST CHAIR**
Linda Jo Fitz
- ADVISORY COUNCIL
CO-CHAIRS**
Michael Alexander
Paul Sedway
- BOARD MEMBERS**
Carl Anthony
Veronica Bell
Chris Block
Larry Burnett
Michaela Cassidy
Michael Cohen
Madeline Chun
Charmaine Curtis
Oz Erickson
Manny Flores
Geoff Gibbs
Gillian Gillett
Chris Gruwell
Ed Harrington
Dave Hartley
Aidan Hughes
Chris Iglesias
Laurie Johnson
Vijay Kumar
Susan Leal
Dick Lonergan
John Madden
Jacinta McCann
Hydra Mendoza
Ezra Mersey
Terry Micheau
Mary Murphy
Jeanne Myerson
Adhi Nagraj
Brad Paul
Rich Peterson
Joan Price
Chris Poland
Teresa Rea
Byron Rhett
Rebecca Rhine
Wade Rose
Paul Sedway
Victor Seeto
Elizabeth Seifell
Carl Shannon
Chi-Hsin Shao
Doug Shoemaker
Ontario Smith
Bill Stotler
Stuart Sunshine
Gary Teague
Michael Teitz
Mike Theriault
Will Travis
Molly Turner
Jeff Tumlin
Steve Vettel
Francesca Vietor
Fran Weld
Allison Williams
Cindy Wu

Therefore, we respectfully express our **strong support for the Accessible Parking Policy Advisory Committee recommendations, and we urge the City to seek full implementation of the policy changes**, including those at the local and state level.

Sincerely,



Egon Terplan
SPUR Regional Planning Director

cc: Ed Reiskin, Director of Transportation
Roberta Boomer, Secretary to the Board
John Knox White, Project Manager

From: Conway, Andrew M., DMV
Sent: Tuesday, November 19, 2013 9:23 AM
To: MTABoard
Subject: Recommendations of the Accessible Parking Policy Advisory Committee - Item 12 11/19/2013

Greetings

This regards calendar item 12 on the agenda for the SFMTA Board Meeting of November 19, 2013.

Please accept my apologies for not joining you today as the recommendations of the Accessible Parking Policy Advisory Committee are being considered. I was honored to serve on the committee; the experience was valuable to me personally and thought-provoking given my professional responsibilities with regard to the Department of Motor Vehicles' disabled person license plate and placard programs. I want to extend a special thanks to Ed Reiskin and his staff at the SFMTA and the Carla Johnson of the Mayor's Office on Disability for making me feel welcome as a contributor to this important effort.

While disabled parking policy is largely set at a statewide level, the impact is acutely local. Parking is a limited resource, and its availability affects business success, civic revenue streams, and the general 'livability' of a community. As the Registration Policy and Automation Chief at DMV, I am acutely aware of how our disabled person plate and placard programs affect businesses, individuals, and communities. Unfortunately, discussions involving parking availability, as well as the needs of the disabled community in having access to key parking privileges, inevitably pit stakeholders against each other; success for one group is seen too often as coming at the expense of another. In addition, the conversation often focused on common misconceptions, prejudices, and suffered from a general lack of data.

The significant departure I saw with the Accessible Parking Policy Advisory Committee was a reliance on data and an insistence on collaboration between stakeholders. SFMTA staff should be congratulated on the information they provided to assist the committee in arriving at recommendations. Our facilitators continually promoted thoughtful discussion and progress, and committee members demonstrated valuable honesty.

I urge you to consider moving forward with all the recommendations of the committee, because they represent a significant breakthrough in managing the limited resource that accessible parking has become in so many communities. I am especially moved by the thoughtful and selfless approach taken by committee members representing the disabled community, who made the difficult choice to support recommendations that could restrict existing privileges for disabled person placard and license plate owners. I urge you to respect their sacrifice and intellectual honesty by extending your support to the recommendations of the committee. This action will also further the positive conversations taking place across the state and contribute significantly to solutions to a growing statewide problem.

Thank you for your consideration.

Andrew Conway, Chief
Registration Policy and Automation Branch
916.657.6259



SMALL BUSINESS COMMISSION
OFFICE OF SMALL BUSINESS



CITY AND COUNTY OF SAN FRANCISCO
EDWIN M. LEE, MAYOR

November 8, 2013

Mr. Tom Nolan, Chairman
Board of Directors
San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency
1 S. Van Ness Ave., 7th Floor
San Francisco, CA 94103

Subj: Letter of Support for Policy Recommendations of the SFMTA's Accessible Parking Policy Advisory Committee

Dear Chairman Nolan:

On October 28, 2013, the Small Business Commission (SBC) voted 7-0 in support of the policy recommendations put forth by the SFMTA's Accessible Parking Policy Advisory Committee (APPAC).

Committee member Bob Planthold and SFMTA consultant Lisa Foster presented the impressive work performed by the Committee. The SBC appreciates the difficulties faced by disabled persons seeking convenient accessible parking. Small businesses are familiar with chronic shortages of parking for their customers, and the detrimental effects it has on their livelihoods. For small business owners, the matter is especially acute, as the disability community provides a valuable customer base. Convenient access to commerce is important to the quality-of-life of disabled persons, and is of great interest to small businesses. Accordingly, the SBC acknowledges the shortage of available disabled spaces as one of the most pressing among the many parking-related issues within the City.

The Commission fully supports the efforts proposed by the APPAC to increase disabled parking availability. In addition to the APPAC's recommendations, the Commission calls on SFMTA to consider construction of additional parking garage capacity in neighborhoods throughout the City as part of a comprehensive strategy to alleviate overall on-street parking congestion, which will also directly benefit the disabled.

The APPAC's report of September 9, 2013, contains sensible reforms to state and local laws that the SBC believes will improve conditions for disabled drivers. While many recommendations will require substantial effort at the state level and implementation may take time, the SBC encourages SFMTA to pursue action on those measures within the purview of its Board of Directors or the Board of Supervisors. To its credit, the SFMTA has already acted on at least one recommendation, and deserves to be commended for increasing staff resources dedicated to enforcement against placard misuse!

The SBC was grateful for the presentation and hard work from the APPAC. The Commissioners look forward to expanding their dialogue with SFMTA on a host of issues impacting small businesses, and hope this experience serves as a model for the future.

SUBJ: LETTER OF SUPPORT FOR POLICY RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE SFMTA'S
ACCESSIBLE PARKING POLICY ADVISORY COMMITTEE (11/7/2013)

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in cursive script, appearing to read "Regina Dick-Endrizzi".

Regina Dick-Endrizzi
Director, Office of Small Business

Cc: Board of Supervisors
Ed Reiskin, SFMTA
Jason Elliot, Mayor's Office
Carla Johnson, Mayor's Office on Disability
Todd Rufo, Office of Economic and Workforce Development
Steven Castellanos, California Commission on Disability
Scott Hauge, Small Business California



August 12, 2013

San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency
Board of Directors
1 South Van Ness Avenue
Seventh Floor
San Francisco, CA 94103

Chair Nolan and Board Members,

The Building Owners and Managers Association (BOMA) of San Francisco supports the [Accessible Parking Policy Advisory Committee recommendations](#) to increase access to parking for people with disabilities and reducing disabled parking placard misuse. We appreciate the Mayor's Office on Disability and the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency for their leadership in convening this group, and for including a BOMA San Francisco representative on the advisory committee.

The committee process made it clear that misapplication of disabled parking placards is apparent to all stakeholders. Not only are people with disabilities unable to find parking where they need it, but employees, customers and delivery drivers are negatively affected as well. Indeed, the disabled parking placard system has a direct impact on the economic vitality of San Francisco's small business community.

We urge the City to seek implementation of the recommended policy changes at the local and state level as soon as possible. Thank you.

Sincerely,

John Bozeman
BOMA San Francisco
Manager, Government and Public Affairs

Cc: Ed Reiskin, Director of Transportation
Robert Boomer, Secretary to the Board
John Knox White, Project Manager



SAN
FRANCISCO
**CHAMBER OF
COMMERCE**
Our City. Your Business.

October 10, 2013

Mr. Tom Nolan, Chair of the Board
San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency
1 South Van Ness Avenue, Seventh Floor
San Francisco, CA 94103

RE: SF Chamber Supports Accessible Parking Policy Advisory Committee Recommendations

Dear Chair Nolan and SFMTA Board Members,

The San Francisco Chamber of Commerce, representing over 1500 local businesses, supports the SFMTA's Accessible Parking Policy Advisory Committee recommendations that will reduce disabled parking placard misuse and increase parking availability for everyone. We commend the Mayor's Office on Disability and the San Francisco Municipal Transportation Agency for their leadership in convening a broad cross-section of our community on this committee, including the Chamber of Commerce and others representing diverse stakeholder groups impacted by the difficult issues the committee successfully addressed.

The committee's recommendations will increase parking resources for all motorists and help alleviate traffic congestion by reducing the number of cars circling blocks searching for available parking. These improvements will benefit those who operate businesses and provide services in San Francisco as well as their customers and clients, and will contribute to a healthier economic climate in the city.

The San Francisco Chamber of Commerce supports the Accessible Parking Policy Advisory Committee recommendations, and urges the City to seek full implementation of the policy changes, including those at the local and state levels.

Sincerely,

Jim Lazarus
Senior Vice President for Public Policy

cc: Roberta Boomer, Secretary to the Board (to be distributed to all SFMTA board members); Ed Reiskin, Director of Transportation; John Knox White, Project Manager